

EXHIBIT 12

VERDICT A

NOTE: Complete this form by writing in the names required by your verdict.

On the claim of plaintiff Linda Welch for compensatory damages against defendant Philip Morris USA Inc., as submitted in Instruction Numbers 6, 9, 12, 15 or 18 we, the undersigned jurors, find in favor of:

Phillip Morris USA Inc.
Plaintiff Linda Welch or Defendant Philip Morris USA Inc.

On the claim of plaintiff Linda Welch for compensatory damages against defendant Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation, as submitted in Instruction Numbers 7, 10, 13, 16 or 19 the undersigned jurors, find in favor of:

Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation
Plaintiff Linda Welch or Defendant Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation

On the claim of plaintiff Linda Welch for compensatory damages against defendant R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Co., as submitted in Instruction Numbers 8, 11, 14, 17 or 20 we, the undersigned jurors, find in favor of:

R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Co.
Plaintiff Linda Welch or Defendant R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Co.

NOTE: Complete the following paragraph only if one or more of the above findings is in favor of the plaintiff Linda Welch.

We, the undersigned jurors, assess the compensatory damages of plaintiff Linda Welch at:

\$ _____ (stating the amount)

NOTE: If you found in favor of the plaintiff Linda Welch and against defendant Philip Morris USA Inc., complete the following paragraph by writing in the word(s) required by your verdict.

We the undersigned jurors, find that defendant Philip Morris USA Inc.

_____ liable for punitive damages.
"is" or "is not"

NOTE: If you found in favor of the plaintiff Linda Welch and against defendant Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation, complete the following paragraph by writing in the word(s) required by your verdict.

We the undersigned jurors, find that defendant Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corporation

_____ liable for punitive damages.
"is" or "is not"

NOTE: If you found in favor of the plaintiff Linda Welch and against defendant R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Co., complete the following paragraph by writing in the word(s) required by your verdict.

We the undersigned jurors, find that defendant R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Co.

_____ liable for punitive damages.
"is" or "is not"

NOTE: All jurors who agree to the above must sign below.

Gust B. [Signature]
[Signature]
Sharon H. [Signature]
Michael [Signature]
Vincent Harris
Richard B. Estherton

Teresa H. [Signature]
R. Duane [Signature]
Mary E. Wrennack
Judith A. Ball-Patt

Given by Court
On June 16, 03

[Signature]

Smokefree Network Login:[SIGN UP]	
<input type="text" value="your email"/>	<input type="text" value="Password"/>
Email	Password
<input type="button" value="LOGIN"/> (Forgot Password?)	

Home	Ch.
Headlines	
International News	
News Briefs	
Tobacco News	
Editions	
Categories	
USA, by State	
non-USA, by Country	
Lawsuits	
Organizations	
Quotes	
Subscribe	
Ads	
Info Pages	
Links	
Smokefree.net	

Search News
Search for...
10 results per page
<input type="button" value="SEARCH"/>

Tobacco News:Lawsuits: Welch	type: Welch
RSS: http://tobacco.org/newsfeed/lawsuit/welch.rss	Search Term(s):
[Headlines Only] [Top Stories Only]	
Welch	
[1 - 7 of 7]	
Categories	<input type="checkbox"/> Tobacco firms win case
• Lawsuits	
USA, by State	
• Missouri	
Lawsuits	
• Welch	
Jury rejects complaint	
Jump to full article: Independence (MO) Examiner, 2003-06-18	
Author: DARLA MCFARLAND / The Examiner	
Intro:	
A Jackson County jury Tuesday rejected the claims of 30-year smoker seeking damages from tobacco companies for her lung cancer.	
Linda Welch, 52, of Springfield, Mo., claimed the cigarette makers failed to give sufficient warning of the dangers of smoking. . .	
Independence attorney Ken McClain represented Welch. He said this morning that the jury was "sidetracked" by the defenses' attacks on his client's personal life. . .	
"It is not a new tactic in these cases, it just happened to work on this particular jury," McClain. . .	
McClain is bringing two more tobacco trials to Jackson County courts this year. Trial dates are set for August and October. He has 18 of the cases filed with the court.	
Jump to full article »	
Categories	<input type="checkbox"/> RJ Reynolds wins smoker suit
• Lawsuits	
USA, by State	
• Missouri	
Lawsuits	
• Welch	
Organizations	
• RJR	
Jump to full article: UPI, 2003-06-17	
Intro:	
A Missouri jury Tuesday returned a unanimous verdict in favor of the R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Co. in an individual smoking and health case.	
After deliberating six hours, the jury concluded that Reynolds Tobacco and two additional tobacco-company defendants are not responsible for the illness of Linda Welch, a smoker who claimed she developed lung cancer from smoking the RJR's' products.	
Jump to full article »	
Categories	<input type="checkbox"/> Tobacco Companies Not Liable, Jury Says
• Lawsuits	
USA, by State	
• Missouri	
Lawsuits	
• Welch	
Organizations	
• MO	
• RJR	
• B&W	
Verdict in a \$9-million suit filed by a Missouri cancer patient is the latest victory for the industry in a series of damages claims.	
Jump to full article: Bloomberg News, 2003-06-18	
Intro:	
Philip Morris USA, R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Holdings Inc. and Brown & Williamson Tobacco Co. convinced a jury that they weren't responsible for the lung cancer of a Missouri woman, the	

Categories

- Lawsuits
- USA, by State**
- Missouri
- Lawsuits**
- Welch
- Organizations**
- RJR

companies said Tuesday.

A state court jury in Independence, Mo., deliberated about six hours before rejecting claims by Linda Welch, a 30-year smoker who was diagnosed with cancer in 1995.

Welch, 51, had sought \$9 million in compensatory damages in the trial that started May 12.

[Jump to full article »](#)

R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Company Wins Welch: Individual Smoker Suit in Missouri

Jump to full article: PR Newswire, 2003-06-17

Author: Source: R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Company

Intro:

A Missouri jury today returned a unanimous verdict in favor of R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Company in an individual smoking and health case. After deliberating for six hours, the jury concluded that Reynolds Tobacco and two additional tobacco-company defendants were not responsible for the illness of Linda Welch, a smoker who claimed that she developed lung cancer from smoking the companies' products.

"This verdict shows once again that jurors who have seen the evidence generally use their common sense and conclude that smokers have long been aware of the well-known risks of smoking, and that people who choose to smoke in the face of these known risks should not be financially rewarded," said Jeff Furr, Reynolds Tobacco's lead attorney in the case.

[Jump to full article »](#)

UPDATE - Top three U.S. cigarette makers win smoker suit

(Adds background on other cases, byline)

Jump to full article: Reuters, 2003-06-17

Author: Jessica Wohl

Intro:

The top three U.S. cigarette makers said on Tuesday they won a unanimous jury verdict in an individual product liability suit in Missouri, adding to the general string of success they have had in individual suits.

The plaintiff, Linda Welch, had claimed the three defendants -- Philip Morris USA, R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Co. and Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp. -- were responsible for her lung cancer.

Welch, 51, had asked the jury to award her almost \$9 million in compensatory damages and to find she was also entitled to punitive damages against the companies, Philip Morris USA, the domestic tobacco unit of Altria Group Inc. (NYSE:MO), said in a statement. . .

In a research note, Prudential Securities tobacco analyst Rob Campagnino said, "We continue to believe that individual trials alone are not significant drivers of tobacco valuations, but we view this as an additional positive data point that has followed on what we view as a fairly successful two months for the tobacco industry." . . .

The three defendants in the Welch case are set to go to trial this August in another individual suit in Independence, Missouri

[Jump to full article »](#)

Categories

- Lawsuits
- USA, by State**
- Missouri
- Lawsuits**
- Welch

Exhibit 12, Page 78

Categories

• Lawsuits

Lawsuits

• Welch

Organizations

• MO

State Court Jury Finds Tobacco Companies Not Liable in Missouri Smoker's Lawsuit**Jump to full article:** Business Wire, 2003-06-17**Author:** Source: Philip Morris USA**Intro:**

A Missouri Circuit Court jury today returned a unanimous verdict in favor of Philip Morris USA and two other tobacco companies in a case brought by a smoker.

Linda Welch, 51, had asked the jury to award almost \$9 million in compensatory damages and find that she also was entitled to punitive damages against PM USA, R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Co. and Brown and Williamson Tobacco Co. She was diagnosed with lung cancer in 1995, and again in 2002.

"Although Ms. Welch has a serious disease, this jury reached the correct verdict based on the law and the facts presented in this case," said William S. Ohlemeyer, Philip Morris USA vice president and associate general counsel.

"In these cases, the real issues are whether people who smoke are aware of the risks of smoking, whether they've been warned about those risks and who the law holds responsible for the informed choices they make. We believe the evidence on each of these issues clearly favored the defense," Ohlemeyer said.

[Jump to full article »](#)**Categories**

• Lawsuits

USA, by State

• Missouri

Lawsuits

• Welch

• UPDATE - Top three U.S. cigarette makers win smoker suit

(Adds details of verdict, comments from companies and industry analyst)

Jump to full article: Reuters, 2003-06-17**Intro:**

The top three U.S. cigarette makers said on Tuesday they won a unanimous jury verdict in an individual product liability suit in Missouri.

The plaintiff, Linda Welch, had claimed the three defendants -- Philip Morris USA, R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Co. and Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp. -- were responsible for her lung cancer.

Welch, 51, had asked the jury to award her almost \$9 million in compensatory damages and to find she was also entitled to punitive damages against the companies, Philip Morris USA, the domestic tobacco unit of Altria Group Inc. (NYSE:MO), said in a statement. . .

In a research note, Prudential Securities tobacco analyst Rob Campagnino said, "We continue to believe that individual trials alone are not significant drivers of tobacco valuations, but we view this as an additional positive data point that has followed on what we view as a fairly successful two months for the tobacco industry."

[Jump to full article »](#)[Show Selected For Printing](#)[Home](#) | [News](#) | [Quotes](#) | [Subscribe](#) | [Info Pages](#) | [Printable](#)

News Articles Copyright by their respective owners.

Other material © 1995-2009 Tobacco.org, may be reprinted in non-commercial venues with appropriate attribution.

Exhibit 12 Page 79

Smokefree Network Login:[SIGN UP]

your email

Email

LOGIN

Password

(Forgot Password?)

[Home](#) [Collections](#) [Profiles](#) [More](#) [Recent Searches](#)

Jump to: [CHOOSE A COLLECTION:](#)

People

Welch v. Philip Morris Inc.

Organizations

(Personal Injury MO Cir. Ct. 2000 Industry Verdict)

Operations

Case

This individual personal injury suit was brought by Linda Welch against Philip Morris, R.J. Reynolds and Brown & Williamson on April 10, 2000.

Additives

The plaintiff alleged that her lung cancer was caused by smoking cigarettes. She was diagnosed with lung cancer in 1995, and in 2002. She alleged that she was addicted to smoking and had never been warned of the health hazards. After she had been diagnosed with cancer she was able to quit smoking. The plaintiff claimed failure to warn, negligence, strict liability, fraudulent concealment, and conspiracy. The plaintiff sought compensatory and punitive damages.

Hypothesis

Demographics

Design Components

Smoke Constituents

The case was heard in the Circuit Court, Jackson County, Independence, Missouri, before the Honorable J.D. Williamson, Jr. The jury returned a verdict was for the defendants on June 17, 2003. No appeals were sought.

[Home](#) | [Collections](#) | [Profiles](#) | [Other Resources](#)

© 1999-2009 Tobacco Documents Online

Exhibit 12, Page 80